

Sauteli Manch (सौतेली मंच)

Dr. Mathachan K J

Assitant Professor

Deparment of Foreign Language

BPS Mahila Vishwavidyalya

Sonipat, Haryana

(Short play)

Organizer : Good morning! Today, we have gathered here to be the part of Haryanvi Manch, the annual event organized by centre of culture studies, Women University Haryana. Dr. Nayan Chaudhary, author of loudly debated book “*Sauteli Manch*” is with us today. The student delegates who are prepared with the questions, please join on the stage for an interaction with Dr. Nayan Chaudhary. Ms. Avneet Kaur, Ms. Renu Malik, Ms. Rajesh Chillar please come on the stage. I welcome Dr. Nayan Chaudhary and all of you for an insightful and fruitful discussion on Plights and Rights of Haryanvi. Thank you.

Ms. Renu Malik: Madam, we would like to hear... how this idea came to you or what has motivated you to write on Haryanvi. The reality today is that most of us do not want to even speak in Haryanvi or discouraged to speak in Haryanvi (Laughs with others).

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: An immediate event that motivated me to think on the issue of Haryanvi is the Mathrbhasha divas celebrations organized by Department of Higher Education, Haryana in 2022. As a faculty member in a university, we all were invited to join online for the event. In Chandigarh, at the office of the DHE, two professors, Head, department of Hindi and Head, department of Punjabi, both from University of Punjab were invited to deliver the talks. Interestingly both of them had turbans probably belonged Sikh community. As the program started, Head of the Hindi department began to speak about how Hindi contributed to the independence movement and later for national integration and how it has positioned to be a world language etc... After 40 minutes talk, without any question answer session, Head of the Punjabi department was asked to deliver the talk. His talk was on how the Punjabi has struggled against Hindi to keep its identity and growth, and how the Punjabi culture and language has contributed for the socio-economic well being of Punjabi speaking people, whereas Hindi as a cultural language is still lagging on this front, by quoting “Bimaru” and “Hindi growth rate instead of ‘Hindu growth rate’ terms used by Indian economists to show the low socio-economic development of the Hindi speaking states like Bihar, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Uttarpradesh. Without any question answer session, that talk was also over. Interestingly, we, the listeners were all Haryanvis. While we enjoyed the Hindi attack on regional languages and Punjabi offensive on Hindi as Bimaru. in goggle meet, a

comment in the chat session, from a Vice Chancellor, Science and Technology University, Haryana made me to think.. The comment was “when elephants fight, suffers the grass”. That comment hit me, and interestingly I checked about that Vice chancellor and come to know that VC had a south Indian background too. As I began to think about it ... both these elephants Hindi and Punjabi are fighting in Haryana and after the fight elephants happily went back to own terrains, where the Haryanvi was crushed, butchered and suffered like the grass. That made me more curious about Haryanvi and the book was the result. (smiles).

Ms. Rajesh
 Chillar: But Haryanvi was never a language, it is a dialect of Hindi... so when we speak Haryanvi we are speaking Hindi only...it is just a corrupt form of Hindi and if others speak Hindi we understand that too... then why the name Sauteli Manch?

Dr. Nayan
 Chaudhary Interestingly this question has many parts... (smiles). What is a language and what is not? How did Hindi become a language and why Haryanvi could not become a language? If you extend further... From where does Haryanvi come? And the second part... we can speak both Hindi and Haryanvi and at home we speak Haryanvi and in school, offices etc... we speak Hindi. So there is no problem at all. We are happy... and why do you want us to be unhappy with the name Sauteli Manch? (Laughs with the audience). Before we discuss these issues, let me ask... How many of you know or gone through the official language act of Haryana?

Ms. Avneet
 Kaur: Let us ask to chat GPT.... or Google..

Dr. Nayan
 Chaudhary: Yes... of course do it... what does it say?

Ms. Renu
 Malik: Let me read the Act... Hindi means Hindi in Devanagari script, shall as from the appointed day, 26/01/1969, be the language to be used for all official purposes of the State of Haryana. Unless and until the State Government otherwise directs by notification, the English language may, as from the appointed day, continue to be used, in addition to-Hindi, for the transaction of business in the Legislature of the State. Punjabi ' means Punjabi in Gurmukhi script, shall be the second language to be used for all such official purposes which the State Government may deem fit.

Dr. Nayan
 Chaudhary : Thank you Renu... it was a good summary. So official language is Hindi, co-official language is English, and second language is Punjabi. At least some of us might surprise to know that second language of Haryana, as per the official language act was Tamil till 2004 (smiles...). Interestingly, does the act speak

anything at anywhere about Haryanvi? There is a complete silence on Haryanvi. Act does not mention it, not even as a vernacular dialect ...and the reality is as we know, Rajesh has already said that at home we speak Haryanvi. I may also add not only at home but also anywhere if two Haryanvis meet then of course, speak in Haryanvi only (laughs...).

Ms. Rajesh Chillar: That is very common to all languages. I have seen south Indians who meet each other anywhere, start speaking in Tamil or in Malayalam. It is natural to everyone. It is not at all anything specific to Haryanvi alone.

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Exactly...(Laughs). It is natural to us to speak in that language in which we feel deeply connected with, more comfortable with... by which we can share our experiences more deeply. If someone scolds you in English and you face a scolding in Haryanvi, which makes you to feel deeper? There was an incident in my life, one of my Bengali friend rebuking her south Indian boyfriend using an English word “Bustard” and he replies... Bus stand? It is in this direction... (All laughs). Many of the slang or swear words from a different language does not touch us the way those words from our mother tongue. So mother tongue is that makes us to be part and parcel of our own community, with its shared experiences, value systems and many kind of narratives specific only to that tongue. That tongue gives us the identity, we feel belonging to that culture, group etc... one feel rooted in that culture. So a language is not only that you speak but that what you are, your thoughts, your value systems everything comes from that language, it is your mother tongue ... your identity. Consider this... a Marathi might speak Hindi and English well, but she carries a Marathi identity and mostly she is proud of it. If a Marathi household where everyone speaks Marathi and asks this Marathi girl not to speak Marathi and give the reason that it is not a language but just a dialect, what happens? She starts feeling inferior among the so called language speakers, and she faces inferiority complex to deal with other languages, even if economically better off than them. A kind of identity crisis..? So a mother tongue is not just a medium of communication, it is an identity and belongingness to a culture.

Ms. Avneet Kaur: But here the issue is not that of mother tongue and languages, but about a dialect. Haryanvi is a dialect not a language. So how does it fit here?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Yes...yes... an interesting observation. Just before we enter into dialect language debate, (smiles...) let me narrate a Birbal story to show how tongues connected to emotions, body language etc. There is good chance that most of you would have heard it. Nevertheless...Birbal was a member of court of Mogul Emperor Akbar. One day a scholar comes to the court and challenges the Akbar's court to identify his mother tongue. Many learned scholars of the court tried to speak in different languages with the guest scholar, but the scholar expressed great fluency so that none of them could identify his mother tongue. To save the dignity of the court emperor Akbar turns to Birbal. Birbal asks for

just one day to solve the issue. Guest Scholar was very happy that anyhow he has already defeated great language experts of the court and emperor shall owe him adequate gifts as compensation and so on. Birbal arranged good care of the guest scholar, and provided the room to stay, food etc... through a servant. As the night passed and at early dawn as the guest scholar was in deep sleep, Birbal asked the servant to pour cold water on the sleeping scholar and just waited for the scholar's reaction outside. As the cold water fell on him, the Scholar shouted and Birbal listened. As the court joined for the next day Birbal came and said, this is scholar's mother tongue. Emperor asked the scholar whether it is true? Scholar agreed. Emperor asked Birbal to explain how he identified scholar's mother tongue. Birbal narrated the incident and the entire court laughed. See the mother tongue has that quality, that it is your first reaction, emotional vehicle etc. A tongue that provides you that emotional and cultural belonging is your mother tongue. Whether you call it a dialect, or language or vernacular medium, but nothing can challenge this aspect of the mother tongue. No language or tongue whether national or international can provide you this emotional cultural sensitivity other than your mother tongue.

Ms Rajesh Chillar: Ms Rajesh: Madam, do you mean that the mother tongue of Haryana is Haryanvi ? not Hindi? Madam ... it is very tricky waters... Do you also suggest that the mathrbhasha divas shall be celebrated for Haryanvi not for Hindi in Haryana?

Dr. Nayan chaudahry : (Smiles..) I leave it open for all of you to decide for yourselves.... The language or tongue that provides such an emotional and cultural belongingness has the natural right to be the mother tongue.

Ms. Renu Malik: But madam... if that tongue or mother tongue does not have scripts.. alphabets and cannot be written.. it is just spoken only... in that case, is it not better to adopt another very similar language which has scripts and can be written ?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary : Yes... yes....the question sounds to be very valid.(smiles). Here the distinction is made between the tongues that can be written and cannot be written. If we connect this question to Haryanvi... the argument is Haryanvi does not have scripts therefore it is a dialect and Hindi has scripts therefore it is a language. Let us take the evolution history of Hindi to understand the scenario well. Every language was once a dialect. There is no language in the world as far as we know that was not a dialect at least for some point of time in its evolution. Tongues evolve orally first and later stages also adopt or gain scripts and writings. It might be interesting to mention that in India we also have some written materials from a language and still we are struggling to read it. Written tablets from Indus valley civilization still remains as a challenge to read. Scripts formation is later part in the evolution history of a tongue or a language. Very recent example is that of Hindi. Can anyone say that when and how did Hindi become a language in India?

Ms. Rajesh
Chillar

Madam... Hindi comes from Sanskrit and it is modern Sanskrit.?

Dr. Nayan
Chaudhary:

No Rajesh... (smiles.) It is an over simplification that too in the wrong direction. A proverb that just come to mind is ... “close the eyes and declare it is dark” (laughs all). Let us open our eyes and look back what actually happened in favor of Hindi. Before independence 1947,north India, was under the Moguls and other Sultans and dynasties before British Raj. It was around 600 princely states under British India and most of the princely states in North India had different tongues and languages. For example Braj, Avadhi, Bhundeli Maithili, Bhojpuri,Magadhi, Dehlavi , Haryanvi, punjabi etc.. Some of them had scripts too. At the time of Mogul, it was Hindustani a version of Persian language was the court language. Some of you might still remember the proverb “ Hath Kankan ko Aarsi kya, Pate likhe ko Farsi kya”.After independance, Indian parliament accepted Devnagiri scripts for Dehlavi dialect (Khariboli) spoken in and around Delhi and declared it as Hindi. In that process all other tongues of northern India lost their influence and predominance, probably to certain extent cultural identity too. Haryanvi, though it is considered to be a dialect of Hindi in India, the language is widely spoken in Sindh. In a closer look it is more Sindhi (Rangri sindhi) than Hindi. Grierson’s massive linguistic survey (1927), Vogelin & Vogelin (1977) identify Haryanvi as western dialect of Hindi along with Braj, Punjabi, Dehlavi etc... Sociolinguistic survey of Haryanvi, published 2024 by Jeff Webster et.al, makes the following observations :

“The findings suggest that Haryanvi is not inherently intelligible with Hindi and that significant segments of the population are not adequately bilingual in Hindi. The findings also suggest that Haryanvi is a vital language and that the Haryanvi speakers have positive attitudes towards their language’. Lexical similarity scores and RTT scores are such that Hindi and Haryanvi would be described as dissimilar dialects or different languages. (p.4)’ moreover the findings suggest that Haryanvi is not inherently intelligible with Hindi. (p.17). “Haryanvi is nearly always used in the home. There is no indication that Haryanvi is being replaced by Hindi in the critical domains of home and religion. The use of the language is an important marker of in-group identification. Attitudes towards Haryanvi and its use are consistently strong and positive. All indications are that it will remain in use as a mother tongue for the foreseeable future. Our initial assessment is that attitudes are quite positive towards literature in Haryanvi (p.5).(Sociolinguistic Survey of Haryanvi, 2024)

So whether one formulates it or not, or any more relevant or not, the argument stands solid. If Indian parliament can accept Devnagri script for Dehlavi tongue and declare it as Hindi, and legislative assembly of Punjab can accept Gurmukhi script for Punjabi tongue and declare it as a Punjabi, was it not possible for legislative assembly of Haryana to accept a script probably different from Hindi and Punjabi to keep its identity and declare Haryanvi as official vernacular along with Hindi and English?

Ms. Avneet Kaur: Madam, the argument is very strong and heart hitting and eye opening. Most of us had never thought about it this way and mostly unaware about the history of these languages. And it is not about language anymore, it is more about cultural identity. Madam ... are you trying to say that if you want to protect Haryanvi culture, it is a must that we recognize it as official vernacular of the state of Haryana?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Yes... that can be the way ahead. It is not only about protecting the Haryanvi culture but it is more about refining the culture too. To bring positive changes to a culture mother tongue is the best medium. Under positive changes we are speaking not only about the customs and rites that are required to change for better survival, but also the mindset and the world view promoted by that culture which acts against the socio-economic development of that community. Consider this 'jiski lati uski bes'. 'Pati fauj me, bivi mauj me' such proverbs, and other narratives represents certain kind of world view of a culture. Just an example how culture promotes worldviews. In that sense refining a culture means, bringing positive elements to change or replace certain world view. Many argue that education is the best way to do it. Agreed ... but if your world views are formed by Marathi and your education is in English or Hindi, mostly it will not affect or affect very less on your world view. Those elements will appear more like an issue of English culture and not ours. The counter narratives and proverbs have to be there in the same tongue to cause the change. You can observe this... If a Marathi goes to England and lives like an English and comes back to Maratha, obviously she will behave mostly like a Marathi than English. Therefore cultural education needs to be in the mother tongue, not to be static with the culture but with a readiness to change for the better survival.

Ms. Rajesh Chillar: This part that English can not refine the vernacular culture, only cultural tongue is best suited for it, sounds like "toda zyada hi kheech liya" (all laugh)

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: At a first glance, of course this is an expected reaction. That reaction assumes that English being much more developed language than the regional vernacular, learning English can make the true changes in a vernacular culture. Let us look little bit deeply. Culture in its core provides a world view to its members. This world view comes from the shared experiences which are present in the narratives and arts and literature. If we want to bring change in this world view then we need that kind of narratives or arts and literature. If you read those narratives in English, it might influence you but the not the collective world view of the culture. But if that narrative is present either translated or narrated in the mother tongue, then it becomes the part of shared narratives of the culture. The world view of the culture becomes more ready to accept those ideas, even though do not change it immediately, at least a dialogue starts

happening. For example in a cultural world view, honour killing is considered to be something correct and justified. But if we want to bring a change in such a world view, a narrative either through art, literature or sciences has to be present in the mother tongue to start the dialogue and to become the part of that world view. For eg., this narrative also from a south Indian friend. Before I narrate, a word of caution. We are here not to verify the exactness of the narrative, but our focus is to show how the narratives influence the world view. In 1990, state of Kerala had a Governor from Haryana, an esteemed scholar. One day Governor had visitors in Raj bhavan in Trivandrum, from his own community in Haryana. After the visit, Governor seems to be very upset and through the P.A to Governor a rumour, I call it a rumour now, because I have checked possible sources, but could not find any record of it... that guests from his own community has come with a threat to kill his daughter who was studying in U.S, for being in relationship with someone from a lower caste or gave gothra entanglement. They had only one thing to be clarified. Whether the act of killing will be done by the father himself or the cousins and relatives need to execute it. Probably the daughter would have never come back to India. I prefer to believe it as a false narrative. But this narrative influenced Malayalam cinema and some films had begun to display certain communities as a horror culture. Therefore cultural education needs to be in the mother tongue, not to be static with the existing culture but to bring changes for the better survival too.

Ms. Avneet Kaur : Honour killing? Father kills daughter for honour? This is horrific. Madam ... you have taken all the peace from our hearts.

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Honour killing? ...just ask chat Gpt or google. You will find materials and scholarly articles on it. Here we are not to discuss about honour killing of daughters but figuratively the dishonouring the mother, the mother tongue.. for a step mother... another language.. (smiles..though sadly)

Ms. Rajesh chiller: Madam... that formulation is very strong and really irritating to any Haryanvi. It is a slap on our faces... at the same time deeply thought provoking. But as you said earlier, many mother tongues faces the same issue. How can we bring Haryanvi out of this situation ?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary : I am really sorry for those formulations and they were not at all intended to irritate anyone. Nevertheless as you said just to provoke our thoughts and to focus our attention on the issue. Now coming to the question. .. how we can bring Haryanvi out of this? In a comparison to other tongues who lost their identities through the voluntary acceptance of Hindi, Haryanvi is placed on a better position. State of Haryana, the name comes from Haryanvi identity. So by accepting Haryanvi as a cultural vernacular in the official language act of Haryana, Haryanvi will get a equal treatment among Hindi and English. By

accepting a script, Haryanvi songs, Haryanvi Newspaper, News channels, in the popular culture, and collection of Haryanvi narratives, a Haryanvi literature will arise. Haryanvi authors will start thinking exclusively for Haryanvi issues. Even a politics, specific to Haryanvi culture and a Haryanvi socio-economic model beyond Delhi dependency can arise. That will make Haryanvi a language that can be taught in schools and a language worth learning. Learning materials, text books and courses will be available for others who want to learn Haryanvi like any other regional languages in India. Haryanvi renaissance will be the result.

Ms. Avneet Kaur: Still I would like to ask... why Hindi can not offer all those same ? Why only Haryanvi ?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Just like that we have already seen, that to have no scripts is an inherent weakness of Haryanvi, similar way Hindi as a language has its own inherent weaknesses. Here we are discussing about the mother tongues. What makes the mother tongue? It is the shared narratives , world views through a common language. Haryanvi has it. Now look at Hindi, it is limited to the shared narratives of Dehlavi region and scripts are taken from Sanskrit. It is an amalgam of cultures and identities without any specific culture. Haryanvi has a specific cultural identity. A Nurse working in AIIMS Delhi once shared that she could have taken a quarters in Delhi, but husband and in-laws are against it because they say that they do not belong to Delhi. More than that she also shared that her salaries are not her salary, but all salaries will be submitted to Mother in law and she has to ask for her daily expenses to mother in law. Then I asked why do not you give salaries to your husband and ask him for your expenses, instead of asking to Mother in law. The replay was husband ka hal bhi vahi hi. She continued.. If I ask him, then he has to ask to Mother in law, also for his own expenses too. What about Father in law...I asked? He can not have any expenses at all other than mother in law's expenses, (all laughs). I asked .. being an educated working women, do not you feel it slightly awkward among your colleagues at AIIMS? She looked at me with gleaming eyes, and happy smile and said proudly, I am a Haryanvi Jat. What she was or what community she belongs is not important here. The statement clearly shows that she feels as a Haryanvi not as a Delhite. These elements might be very specific to Haryanvi world view. I m not sure...(smiles) you know better. So Haryanvi is a mother tongue worth teaching at schools.

Ms. Renu Malik: Madam... so the medium of education should be mother tongue, not Hindi medium or English medium at all?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Dr. Nayan: Medium of education at schools can be any language not necessarily always be the mother tongue. Mother tongue learning is essential to be the part of a culture. Objectives of school education is not to propagate the culture. School education shall also help one to come out of the limitations of one own culture. Here one has to be clear what you want to achieve by education or what kind of education that is being offered? If you want to prepare for scientific mind and global exposure, a linguistic medium which is ideal for that becomes relevant. If you want to understand a culture, then you need a linguistic medium which allows that. If one asks, what is better medium of school education ... Any language medium, which is enriched with science, art and literature is good, but mother tongue shall be a subject at least in that curriculum up to secondary school level.

Ms Renu Malik: Madam ... you were batting strongly for mother tongues before... now have you diluted it in relation to school education?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: An interesting observation.(smiles.) Here there are two aspects: mother tongue as cultural language and medium of instruction at schools. Cultural language is that language or tongue that make one feel to be the part of a culture. Medium of school education is that language by which one is capable of understanding science, technology, literature, business, administrative process, law etc... What is education basically? While being the part of the culture one shall be able to look it from above too. It is not the total acceptance of culture but education allows you to have that internal churning or reflection about one's own cultural positives and limitations. So here the question asked, what language is ideal for medium of school education , of course that language which can offer better socio-economic chances , which acts as a strong base for sciences and technology, which offers best administrative opportunities and international exposure along with art and literature. If a mother tongue capable of these, of course, that is the best. If the mother tongue is good at cultural belongingness but not for sciences and technology, and administrative and international exposure, we have to learn another language of that kind also. Now the question is how do you do it, which shall be the best method? To what degree we shall mix these languages? To be the part of evolving globalized, knowledge economy, one has to choose such a medium of instruction at the school level too. To be the part of one's own cultural belongingness and to be happy with practicing customs and rites only, education medium can be of similar tongue which is ideal for that. Suppose if one wants to be Hindu poojari, which language shall he learn? ... ya correct Sanskrit. If one want to read holy Quran and preach which language shall one learn? .. ya Arabic.. I am not saying that there are no sciences in Sansrit and Arabic. What I am saying that medium of instruction at school education is a choice that you can make. But mother tongue is less a choice, more of it is just given.

Ms Avneet Madam under these considerations, in India, English medium schools are the

- Kaur: best than Hindi medium or any other vernacular medium at this moment. Because English has evolved as a language of science and technology, international business etc
- Dr. Nayan Chaudhary : Yes ... I can understand that well. But at the same time one cannot abandon that mothertongue. Whatever may be the reason, whether it is national integration or to show patriotism, one can not neglect the mothertongue. Mothertongue also shall be the part of school education. Ideal situation for school education is a mothertongue and a language through which science and technology, international exposure is possible. That is the minimum. Then if one wants to learn additional languages, perfect it is great. But no compulsion. Many can have different opinions, but of course this I learned from a Keralite friend. Initially it surprised me too. He conveyed in Kerala, whatever might be the School Board you choose, Malayalam, English and Hindi are compulsory up to 10th. Until 2000, generally English medium schools were under private management and Malayalam medium schools were under the govt. Now for the last two decades since 2003, Govt schools in Kerala offers both Malayalam and English medium divisions from std 1 and the ratio is 1:1 (2012). If there is a division for Malayalam medium, next division is for English medium in the same school and if there are more than 30 students in an English medium class, school can start another English medium division too. Technically 90% the Keralite govt schools offer English medium classes. Keralites, considering the international exposure and economic chances, prefer English medium education, and govt want to make sure that economically weaker sections who depend upon the Govt schools for education shall not be deprived of this. So technically speaking all schools are English medium schools. Malayalam is taught compulsorily up to 10th in all kinds of Boards. How do you find this method?
- Ms. Rajesh Chillar: Under this model, madam.. in Haryana, Harianvi shall be taught as monthertongue up to 10th std and Schools shall be English medium schools only.
- Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: In Haryana, there are English medium schools under private management affiliated to different school boards. Most of the aided and govt schools are not Haryanvi medium but Hindi Medium. Haryanvi is never taught in schools. To understand that argument let us analyze the concept of fully developed language. A language functions effectively for Administration, with science and technology, with local and global business and has a large art and literature can be considered as a developed language. C D Deshmukh has pointed out: "There are three levels at which any language may conveniently be considered in various aspects, viz, the colloquial, the literary and the technical"(Deshmukh 1972,p.61)..

Ms. Rajesh chiller: If a Haryanvi pupil does his education in Hindi medium school with English ,is it not learning two fully developed languages simultaneously, Is it not better than learning Haryanvi and English?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: If someone wants to do so or think that it is the best choice, It is ok. On the other hand if one looks into the concept of developed language one can map and identify the degree of development. Let us openly discuss ... it is never intended to provoke anybody's feelings and ideologies. Here the question is how developed Hindi and How developed is English? Hindi was a just another dialect Dehlavi without scripts. Dehlavi was a cultural tongue of the people in and around Delhi. Before and even after declaring Hindi as an official language it could not grow up to that status. Though Hindi was accepted by the other mothertongue cultures like Haryanvi, at home these culture prefer to speak in Haryanvi, Maithili, Bhojpuri etc.. only. Hindi did not had any literature, and the literary works in Braj, Maithili etc are considered to be literary heritage of Hindi. Regarding sciences , Hindi still lacking in research publications. As language of business, it has very limited sphere. Regarding international exposure once again very limited chances. Moreover most of the Hindi speaking states still remains as less developed economically too. English on the other hand introduced in India by Lord Maclauy to teach sciences like medicine and Law. English was the administrative Language of India for 200 years. Not only for India, but also for English common wealth countries like, USA, Australia, Canada, New Zealand, South Africa and many other smaller countries like Singapore, Hongkong etc. As English is the major language of many countries , both literary and sciences are generally either translated or directly written to English. Moreover English is the language of global business. So how do you conclude, which medium shall bring you the better chances? Hindi or English? I leave the answer for you to decide yourself... (smiles..)

Ms. Rajesh chiller: Let us have some questions from audience too... Yes please ask your question.

Ms. Rajbala It was really a tough session, sometimes I felt myself less confident, other times I was happy to see those cultural elements of Haryanvi.. all together ... I am grateful for such a thought provoking session. Coming to my question... as it is presented here... so school education in Haryana shall be if possible in English medium and Haryanvi should be taught as a mandatory cultural vernacular up to 10 th standard. Those who are interested to study in Hindi Medium, that is also O.K, but Haryanvi shall be taught as a mandatory subject up to 10th standard there too.

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: Yes.. it is a good summary... But I leave it open for you to make your own conclusions.

Ms. Tanu Punia: Madam .. we are discussing here about languages ... what is your opinion about south Indian resistance against Hindi , and future of Hindi as a national language?

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary: These questions are politically and ideologically loaded (laughs). My opinion is based on the above discussions only. Hindi as a national language? At present there is no national language in India. What is there is official language act and it says both Hindi and English act as official languages in India. Regarding south Indian resistance against Hindi, let me correct here, I think south Indian resistance is not against Hindi as such but it is against Hindi imposition, making mandatory subject for learning at school level. Resistance against Hindi imposition makes sense if one look into following aspects. South Indians have well developed vernacular mother tongues with arts and literature. Secondly in relation to better economic chances, global exposure and science and technology, English offers much better than Hindi. Therefore there will be a natural inclination to English than Hindi. Instead of the word resistance, more appropriate is relevance. Under these conditions Hindi becomes irrelevant for south Indians. Even in Haryana, Hindi is relevant because vernacular mother tongue Haryanvi is locked and neglected. If Haryanvi is made free and becomes fully developed vernacular, and acts as mother tongue of Haryana, Hindi becomes irrelevant for Haryanvis too. One thing is clear, the language of the developed economies say , German, French, Japanese , and Korean naturally attracts more learners. In relation to that there was a comment from a south Indian JNUite. South Indians by default will commit themselves to learn Hindi, if Hindi speaking belt of India is socially and economically developed and it starts to provide better economic opportunities. At present, Hindi speaking parts of India are the least developed both on Per capita income and HDI. Among the so called Hindi speaking states, Haryana stands better both on GDP and on Per capita income. It could be that Haryanvi culture still provides that belongingness and identity and is getting translated into economic development, and if Haryanvi is strengthened and refined, it may bring lot of development in HDI also.(smiles..)

Ms. Muskan Sharma: Madam... How a language is connected with socio-economic development? Hindi speakers are less developed, English speakers are most developed.. What kind of argument it is? Madam pls...

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary : Interesting... very relevant question.(smiles..) We have already seen that culture provides certain world views to its members. Let us do this test ...Muskan , How many languages do you know?

Ms.Muskan Sharma: I speak three languages , Haryanvi, Hindi and English.. understand Punjabi too

Dr. Nayan Chaudhary : Excellent.. Out of these languages how many of them are a language of developed economies in the world? Only one .. that is English. Now let us consider who speak only Haryanvi... Will that person's world view be similar to that of someone like Muskan who speak four languages? Very rare chance I think... and that is also one reason that older generation is unwilling to accept changes that looks obvious for the young generation ... generation gap.. Generation gap is nothing but a change in the world view. And the world view is created and maintained by that cultural language. If Muskan had also learned German, French and Japanese the world view of the Muskan would have more evolved and she would be better prepared to grab economic opportunities offered by these advanced economies. In case of some one who is proficient only in Haryanvi, might consider learning another language itself as irrelevant because the world view he/she possesses limits it. Culture offers certain world views and those world views are created , maintained and refined through languages. Any how let me narrate a story.. or an incident I am not sure ...I read it or somebody told me .. though I checked later in Google too, I could not find it. So consider it only as a story. The story goes like this ... after implementing first and second five year plans in India, Prime minister Nehru invites a delegation of American management think tanks to India for an appraisal. The delegation included David McClelland. After visiting newly established steel plants and other companies under the Public sector, delegates come to meet Pandit Nehru. As many others were discussing about the potential of American support for Indian industrialization, Pandit Nehru turns to David McClelland about his opinion.. and McClelland replied .. Honorable Prime minister, I would just restrict myself by saying this ... development is a cultural trait. Some of the Indian members felt it as a racist comment... felt offended too, but later on Pandit Nehru became very keen in establishing IITs and IIMs across India with support of many developed economies of the time. So if development is a cultural trait, language is connected to development . (smiles.) but of course I leave it for you to think further on it.

Organizer: Still there are questions left (smiles..) No issues.. we can take it informally in the break sessions. It was a great session... on behalf of all of us here, I thank you Dr. Nayan Chaudhary for leading the session. I extend my gratitude to student representatives who came prepared and participated in the discussion . Thank you for all of you who came and graciously listened and made the interaction very alive . Let us join for a Tea break ... Thank you.
